

Community statement on the START trial and the change in the US DHHS treatment guidelines

INSIGHT Community Advisory Board

Introduction

The following statement is produced in response to a change in the US treatment guidelines in December 2009 that stated that antiretroviral (ARV) treatment should be universally started at any CD4 count below 500 cells/mm³.

The START study is currently enrolling patients to look at whether there is evidence to support such a recommendation. Currently no randomised trial has provided data on the advantages and risks of earlier treatment. This statement affirms both the importance of the START trial and the safety for people who enrol.

We believe that the priority for HIV-positive people is to have accurate, reliable data on both the risks and benefits of earlier treatment in order to base any decision for when to start treatment.

We fully support this study and invite other individuals and community organisations to endorse the importance of this research. Endorsements can be sent to endorsestart@gmail.com.

Statement

When to start antiretroviral treatment is one of the most important outstanding questions for people with HIV and their clinicians. A large clinical trial, Strategic Timing of Antiretroviral Treatment (START), has begun and will hopefully help answer this and other important questions. [1]

The START trial includes antiretroviral-naïve HIV-positive people with CD4 counts greater than 500 cells/mm³. It is taking place at about 90 sites in nearly 30 countries. Participants are randomised to either receive antiretroviral treatment immediately or to defer treatment until their first CD4 count less than 350 cells/mm³ or they have clinical signs of AIDS. Eventually, START will recruit 4,000 people.

The deferred arm is the current standard of care throughout the world, with guidelines recommending treatment at a CD4 count of 350 cells/mm³. Clinical trials have demonstrated that once the CD4 count drops to below 350 cells/mm³, antiretroviral treatment should begin. [2, 3] However, the recent US guideline change requires a community response for US patients who still want to take part in this study.

On 1 December 2009, the United States (US) Guidelines for the Use of Antiretroviral Agents in HIV-1-Infected Adults and Adolescents were changed to recommend treatment for patients with CD4 counts between 350 and 500 cells/mm³. Of the more than two-thirds of Panel members who supported this recommendation, 55% recommended it strongly and 45% moderately. As explained in the guidelines, this recommendation is based solely on observational data primarily from two large cohorts known as ART CC and NA-ACCORD. As with all observational data the findings from these cohorts could be subject to confounding factors. [4]

Indeed, the ART CC investigators have stated, “We are concerned that some may interpret the new [US] recommendations as implying that the deferral group of this trial is no longer ethical. Such an interpretation would endanger the future of the trial in the [US].” [5]

They further state, “We ... do not believe that there is convincing evidence to conclude that deferral

of initiation of ART to a CD4 count of [350 cells/mm³] causes net harm, particularly in terms of mortality, compared with starting at any higher level. We strongly support continued enrolment into START. Large randomised studies represent the only means of eventually obtaining the definitive result we need to properly inform future patient care.

We agree with the ART CC investigators. The available evidence is insufficient to determine if the adherence challenges and long-term side-effects of early antiretroviral treatment are outweighed by reduced risk of illness conferred by these medicines. Only a randomised controlled trial, such as START, can determine this.

The NA-ACCORD data is also challenged by the researchers who originally developed the new statistical methodology. They were not convinced that the application thereof was without problems. [6]

We too are concerned that the new US recommendation:

- (1) raises theoretical concerns about continued enrolment of patients in the US, a substantial source of patients, and
- (2) is based on poor evidence and therefore might not be in the best interests of patients.

We also have further concerns that:

- (3) previous recommendations to use earlier treatment failed to recognise the negative impact of resistance and side effects, and
- (4) a minority of individuals have normal CD4 counts between 350-500 and would therefore be using treatment prior to any significant immune damage.

We support research findings that the absolute risk of HIV-related complications remains very low at a CD4 count 350–500 and that individuals enrolled in START will be carefully monitored and access treatment if their health circumstances change.

We also support the unique importance of sub-studies in START.

These studies have the potential to answer important questions relating to the impact of HIV, treatment and ageing on neurology and mental health, bone health, heart disease, lung disease and behaviour risk.

We support the START investigators, community advocates and HIV-positive people interested in this dynamic research which will help close the essential gap in our current knowledge on the safety and risks of earlier treatment.

Signed:

(Members of the INSIGHT Community Advisory Board in surname alphabetical order)

Peer Aagaard, Denmark
Simon Collins, London
Nathan Geffen, South Africa
Joseph Hall, USA
David H. Haerry, Switzerland
Michael Meulbroek, Spain
David Munroe, USA
Dwight Peavy, USA
Claire Rappoport, USA
Siegfried Schwarze, Germany
Mirta Valdez, Argentina
Jo Watson, Australia

Organizational Endorsers

Asociación de vih/sida (ADHARA), Diego Garcia
Acadiana Cares, Marcia Dorsey, Lafayette, LA, USA
ACT UP PHILAELPHA, Jose de Marco, Philadelphia, PA, USA
Adhara-Sevilla, Juan Antonio Reina, Sevilla, Spain
AIDS Action Baltimore, Lynda Dee, Baltimore, MD, USA
AIDS Action Committee of MA, Denise McWilliams, Boston, MA, USA
AIDS Action Council of the ACT, Andrew Burry, Canberra, ACT, Australia
AIDS Alabama, Kathie Hiers, Birmingham, AL, USA
AIDS Alliance for Faith and Health, Dawn Womack, Reverend Jamil Willis, Atlanta, GA, USA
AIDS Care Ocean State, JoAnne Ash, Pamerla Dee, Daniel Zariczny, Providence, RI, USA
AIDS Care, Jackie Dozier, Rochester, NY, USA
AIDS Community Research Consortium, Megan O'Day, Redwood City, CA, USA
AIDS Community Research Initiative of America, Daniel Tietz, New York, NY, USA
AIDS Education Global Information System, Sister Mary Elizabeth, San Juan Capistrano, CA, USA
AIDS Global Action, Blair Wynkoop, Washington, DC, USA
AIDS Legal Council of Chicago, Ann Fisher, Chicago, IL, USA
AIDS Project Los Angeles, Philip Curtis, Los Angeles, CA, USA
AIDS Project of the East Bay, Damon Powell, Oakland, CA, USA
AIDS Resource Council, Inc., Frank Tant, Rome, GA, USA
AIDS Services for the Monadnock region, Arnold Grandell, Gilsum, NH, USA
AIDS Services of Dallas, Don Maison, Dallas, TX, USA
AIDS Treatment Activist Coalition, Matt Sharp, Brisbane, CA, USA
AIDS/HIV Health Alternatives, Terry Grand, North Hollywood, CA, USA
AIDSmeds.com, Tim Horn, New York, NY, USA
Allies Linked for the Prevention of HIV and AIDS (a.l.p.h.a.), Duane Quintana, Boise, ID, USA
amFAR, The Foundation for AIDS Research, Chris Collins, Washington, DC, USA
Argus Community, Terese Smauldon, Bronx, NY, USA
Australian Federation of AIDS Organisations (AFAO), Don Baxter, Sydney, New South Wales, Australia
AVAC, Kevin Fisher, Mitchell Warren, New York, NY, USA
Beacons of H.O.P.E., Dean Page, West Covina, CA, USA
Black AIDS Memphis, Ernest Donelson, Memphis, TN, USA
Boston Living Center, Wayne Callahan, Mattapan, MA, USA
Care Directions, Jose Alfredo Alvarez, Phoenix, AZ, USA
Center for AIDS, Paul Simmons, Houston, TX, USA
Central City AIDS Network, Johnny Fambro, Macon, GA, USA
CHAIN, Virginia Tonelli, Des Moines, IA, USA
Chicago Womens AIDS Project, Zoe Lehman, Chicago, IL, USA
Choose Life, Patson Phiri, Pretoria, Gauteng, South Africa
Christie's Place, Irene Milton, San Diego, CA, USA
Community Partners CAB Member, Hamilton Richardson, Baltimore, MD, USA
Common Ground - the Westside HIV Community Center, Jeffrey Goodman, Santa Monica, CA, USA
Community HIV/AIDS Mobilization Project (CHAMP), Julie Davids, Walton Senterfitt, Cranston, RI, USA
Community Research Initiative, Anthony Carpinelli, Boston, MA, USA
Coordinadora de asociaciones de VIH de la Comunidad Valenciana, Begoña Bautista Casanova, Spain
Denver Health, Joshua Blum, Denver, CO, USA
Desert AIDS Project, Peter DeMartino, Palm Springs, CA, USA

Duke University AIDS Research and Treatment Community Advisory Board, Anthony Wright, Charlotte, NC, USA
 Dunshee House / SASG, Jake Ketchum, Dale Rogers, Seattle, WA, USA
 E.C.H.O. Resource Center, Ann Dixon, North Little Rock, AR, USA
 European AIDS Treatment Group, Haerry David Hans-Ulrich
 European Community Advisory Board, Wim Vandavelde
 Foundation for Integrative AIDS Research (FIAR), George Carter, Brooklyn, NY, USA
 Gay City News, Doug Ireland, New York, NY, USA
 Gay Men's Health Crisis / Client Advisory Board, Joseph Arsenault, Bronx, NY, USA
 Global Network of People Living with HIV/AIDS (GNP+/NA), Dr. Frenk Guni, Silver Spring, MD, USA
 Grupo de Trabajo sobre Tratamientos del VIH (gTt), Juanse Hernández, Barcelona, Cataluña, Spain
 Grupo Português de Ativistas sobre Tratamentos de VIH/SIDA (GAT), Wim Vandavelde, Portugal
 Harm Reduction Institute, Larry Pasco, Indianapolis, IN, USA
 Health Equities institute, San Francisco State University, Nicholas J. Alvarado, San Francisco, CA, USA
 Health GAP (Global Access Project), Paul Davis, Nairobi, Kenya
 HealthHIV, Brian Hujdich, Washington, DC, USA
 Hepatitis, AIDS, Research Trust, James Hoyt, Florence, CO, USA
 HIV Dental Alliance, David Reznik, Atlanta, GA, USA
 Hiv-Danmark, Bent Hansen, Copenhagen, Denmark
 HIV/AIDS Advocacy Network, Randal Lucero, Albuquerque, NM, USA
 HIV/AIDS Law Project, Karen Stuart, Phoenix, AZ, USA
 HIV/AIDS Services for African Americans in Alaska, Hugh Brown III, Anchorage, AK, USA
 HIV Denmark, Henrik Arildsen
 HIV Europe, Henrik Arildsen
 HIV i-Base, Polly Clayden, UK
 HIVictorious, Inc., Bob Bowers, Madison, WI, USA
 Holley Gerald Foundation, Calvin Gerald, Washington, DC, USA
 Housing Works, Christine Campbell, Washington, DC, USA
 Illinois Alliance for Sound AIDS Policy, J Michael Polasek, Iuka, IL, USA
 International AIDS Empowerment, Lorenzo Sias Jr., El Paso, TX, USA
 International Treatment Preparedness Coalition (ITPC), Sarah Zaidi
 International Community of Women Living with HIV and AIDS-North American Region (ICW-NA), Beri Hull, Washington, DC, USA
 International Foundation for Alternative Research in AIDS, Fred Schaich, Portland, OR, USA
 Italian League For Fighting Aids - LILA, Alessandra Cerioli, Torino, Italy
 Jo-Ray House Inc, Ida Bythersmith, Chicago, IL, USA
 LaGender Inc., Dee Dee Chamblee, Atlanta, GA, USA
 Lesbian, Gay, Transexual and Bisexual Spanish Federation (FELGTB),Rubén Sancho
 LifeLinc, Wanda Commander, Baltimore, MD, USA
 LIGHT Health & Wellness Comprehensive Services, Inc., Debbie Rock, Baltimore, MD, USA
 Lion Heart Network Advocates, A. Alberto Abello, San Francisco, CA, USA
 Lower East Side Harm Reduction Center, Rev Raquel Algarin, New York, NY, USA
 Madrid LGTB Group (COGAM), Rafael Torres Barrio, Spain
 Maine General Health Associates - The Horizon Program, Peter Schlosser, Gardiner, ME, USA
 McGregor Clinic, Inc., Sharon Murphy, Fort Myers, FL, USA
 Metropolitan Community Health Services, Elizabeth Shepherd, Washington, NC, USA
 MiamiValleyPoz4Poz, Keith Matthews, Dayton, OH, USA
 NAM, Keith Alcorn, London, UK
 Nashville CARES, Joseph Interrante, Nashville, TN, USA

National AIDS Housing Coalition, Lola Adele-Oso, Washington, DC, USA
National Association of People Living With HIV/AIDS Australia, Robert Mitchell, Newtown, NSW, Australia
National Coalition for LGBT Health, Kellan Baker, Washington, DC, USA
National Pediatric AIDS Network, Gary Gale, Boulder, CO, USA
New Destiny Recovery Ministry, Rowena Simmons, Baltimore, MD, USA
New York Law School, Arthur Leonard, New York, NY, USA
North American Old Catholic Church, Archbishop Michael Seneco, Washington, DC, USA
Northwestern University, Eric Christoff, Chicago, IL, USA
NW Florida AIDS/HIV Consortium Area (NOFLAC), James Talley, Pensacola, FL, USA
OCASET, Jose Diaz, San Juan, PR, USA
OptimalTrials, James Karin, Gaithersburg, MD, USA
Outer Cape Dental Center, Timothy Martinez, South Wellfleet, MA, USA
Pacientes de Sida pro Politica Sana, Anselmo Fonseca, SJ, PR, USA
PALSS, Carmen Julious, Columbia, SC, USA
PH RockWood.com, Dr. Roscoe M Moore Jr., Rockville, MD, USA
Philadelphia FIGHT, Teresa Sullivan, Philadelphia, PA, USA
Positive East Tennesseans, Larry Frampton, Knoxville, TN, USA
Positive Life NSW, Rob Lake, Darlinghurst, Sydney, NSW, Australia
Positive Women's Network/Oakland/Local, Loren Jones, Berkeley, CA, USA
Positively Positive, Bradford McIntyre, Vancouver, BC, Canada
POZ Charlotte.org, Clinton Woods, charlotte, NC, USA
Progressive Health partners International, Dr. Frenk Guni, Frederick, MD, USA
Projecte dels NOMS-Hispanosida, Michael Meulbrook
Public Personalities Against AIDS Trust, Tendayi Westerhof, Harare, Zimbabwe
PWA Coalition Colorado, Chad Kenney, Denver, CO, USA
Research + Education Group INSIGHT Wash DC ICC CCG Member, Dale Sattergren, Portland, OR, USA
Resource Center Dallas, Bret Camp, Dallas, TX, USA
Roper St. Francis Ryan White Program, Ashley Redmond, Charleston, SC, USA
Ruth M. Rothstein CORE Center, Peter McLoyd, Chicago, IL, USA
Ryan White Part-C, George Martinez-Alicea, Guayama, PR, USA
Shanti, Derrick Mapp, San Francisco, CA, USA
SisterLove, Inc., Lisa Diane White, Atlanta, GA, USA
SomeoneCares of Atlanta, Laurency Gaston, Smyrna, GA, USA
South Carolina Campaign to End AIDS (SC-C2EA), Karen Bates, Columbia, SC, USA
Spanish Community Advisory Board (FEAT), Diego Garcia, Spain
Spanish Federation of AIDS NGOs (CESIDA), Santiago Pérez Avilés,
Status C Unknown, Shari Foster, Medford, NY, USA
SUNY Downstate Medical Center, Michael Carden, Brooklyn, NY, USA
Tapestry Health, Leslie Laurie, Florence, MA, USA
Terrence Higgins Trust, Paul Ward, London, UK
Test Positive Aware Network, Jeff Berry, Chicago, IL, USA
The Afiya Center HIV Prevention & Sexual Reproductive Justice, Marsha Jones, Dallas, TX, USA
The AIDS Institute, David Miller, Carl Schmid, Washington, DC, USA
The Center for HIV Law and Policy, Catherine Hanssens, New York, NY, USA
The Montefiore Women's Center, Anitra Pivnick, Bronx, NY, USA
2 God B The Glory, Women Supportive Housing Program, Rowena Simmons, Baltimore, MD, USA
Tom Waddell Clinic, David Glennon, San Francisco, CA, USA
Transdiaspora Network, Inc., Ariel Rojas, Brooklyn, NY, USA

Treatment Action Campaign, Vuyiseka Dubula, South Africa
 Treatment Action Group, Lei Chou, Mark Harrington, Richard Jefferys, New York, NY, USA
 Treatment Education Network, Michael Dorosh, Denver, CO, USA
 Triad Health Project, Melissa Moorehead, Greensboro, NC, USA
 TVEP, Tian Johnson, Johannesburg, South Africa
 Twin States Network, Jo Schneiderman, Guilford, VT, USA
 U.S. Positive Women's Network (PWN), Naina Khanna, Berkeley, CA, USA
 UDCAS, Jose Diaz, San Juan, PR, USA
 UKCAB, Michael Marr, London, UK
 University of Minnesota, Alicen Spaulding, Minneapolis, MN, USA
 Virginia Commonwealth University, Joy Zeh, Richmond, VA, USA
 Wayne State University CAB, Janyce Cook, Detroit, MI, USA
 West Ohio UMC Conference AIDS Ministry, Lonny LeFever, Conover, OH, USA
 Zephyr L.T.N.P. Foundation, Inc., Loreen Willenberg, Sacramento, CA, USA

Individual Endorsers

Rafael Abadia, Palm Beach Gardens, FL, USA	Marcia Ellis, Alexandria, VA, USA
Scott Amundsen, Oneonta, NY, USA	Shira EtShalom, Philadelphia, PA, USA
Jared Baeten, Seattle, WA, USA	David Evans, Los Angeles, CA, USA
Sean Barry, Brooklyn, NY, USA	Marta Feldmesser, Bronx, NY, USA
Lincoln Bartholomew, New York, NY, USA	Robert Ferguson, Ann Arbor, MI, USA
Amanda Beck-Myers, Edgewood, KY, USA	Phillip Fielding, Ridley Park, PA, USA
Jeanne Bergman, New York, NY, USA	Heather Fisch, Providence, RI, USA
Richard Berkowitz, New York, NY, USA	Anna Forbes, Kensington, MD, USA
David Brakebill, Key West, FL, USA	Kenneth Fornataro, New York, NY, USA
Matthew Bray, Brooklyn, NY, USA	Elana Galante, San Francisco, CA, USA
Paul Brodish, Carrboro, NC, USA	Gregg Gonsalves, New Haven, NY, USA
Lara Brooks, Chicago, IL, USA	Jeffrey Goodman, Santa Monica, CA, USA
Raymond Brooks, Manchester, NH, USA	Deirdre Grant, New York, NY, USA
Keith Burress, Malvern, PA, USA	Claudia Grayson, Sacramento, CA, USA
Rob Camp, Barcelona, Catalunya, Spain	Hamilton Gregory, Ardmore, OK, USA
Tom Cassady, Fort Worth, TX, USA	Kathlee Griffith, Peoria, IL, USA
Peter Cecil, Rockdale, IL, USA	Johnny Guaylupo, New York, NY, USA
Bryan Cole Smith, Wenonah, NJ, USA	Andres Guerrero, Denver, CA, USA
Regina Cossey, Gary, IN, USA	Anthony Guillaume, Queens Village, NY, USA
Eduviges Cuello, Santo Domingo, Distrito Nacional, Dominican Republic	Lyn Hackenberg, Ambler, PA, USA
Vince Cukrov, San Simeon, CA, USA	Bridget Haire, Sydney, NSW, Australia
Mitch DeBoer, Indianapolis, IN, USA	Mark Hall, Maryville, TN, USA
Randolph Decker, Tucson, AZ, USA	Graham Harriman, New York, NY, USA
Nikos Dedes, Greece	Phillip Herrington, Pittsburgh, PA, USA
Thomas DeLorenzo, Los Angeles, CA, USA	Steve Hoke, Vero Beach, FL, USA
Cheryl Derocher, Miamisburg, OH, USA	Lital Hollander, Rovello Porro, CO, Italy
Jose Diaz, Puerto Rico, USA	Trevor Hoppe, Ann Arbor, MI, USA
Ben W. Dunn III, New York, NY, USA	Bob Huff, San Diego, CA, USA
Jim Eigo, New York, NY, USA	Ashley Hunt, Van Nuys, CA, USA
William Ellington, Detroit, MI, USA	Howard Joyce, Detroit, MI, USA
	Dr. Lynne Joyrich, Warwick, RI, USA

Sharon Kathrens, Kansas City, MO, USA
 Ingrid Kloet, Rio Rancho, NM, USA
 Robert Krier, Anchorage, AK, USA
 Vickie Lynn, Tampa, FL, USA
 Peggi Marini, Boston, MA, USA
 David P. Martin, New York, NY, USA
 Sylvia Mata, Fullerton, CA, USA
 Jeff Mathews, Albuquerque, NM, USA
 Shirley Mathis, Dallas, TX, USA
 Linda McFarlane, Los Angeles, CA, USA
 Jacqueline Melvin, Durham, NC, USA
 Terrell Moody, Alma, GA, USA
 Clyde "RAY" Moore, Granbury, TX, USA
 Timothy Moore, Santa Cruz, CA, USA
 Bernardino Mosquera, Miami Beach, FL, USA
 Joshua O'Neal, Seattle, WA, USA
 William Palmer, Baltimore, MD, USA
 Earl Plante, Hayward, CA, USA
 Niles Puckett, Jackson, MS, USA
 Eliza Quill, Augusta, ME, USA
 Kevin Quinn, Boston, MA, USA
 Gary Richardson, Painesville, OH, USA
 Margy Robinson, Portland, OR, USA
 Jorge Romero, Vauxhall, NJ, USA
 Douglas Rose, Abingdon, MD, USA
 Frieda S, Jacksonville, FL, USA
 David Sackett, Baltimore, MD, USA
 Rickey Sain Sr., Oak Park, IL, USA
 Nicole Seguin, Detroit, MI, USA
 Matt Sharp, San Francisco, CA, USA
 Sandy Sheble-Hall, Dover, MA, USA
 Steve Shoptaw, Los Angeles, CA, USA
 Patricia E. Sloan, Chicago, IL, USA
 Joseph Sonnabend, New York, NY, USA
 Val Sowell, Philadelphia, PA, USA
 Jean Stanford, Boston, MA, USA
 John Stimatz, Seattle, WA, USA
 Autrey Stinett, Glorieta, NM, USA
 Sean Strub, Founder, POZ Magazine, New York, NY, USA
 Scott Terry, Albuquerque, NM, USA
 Christopher Thomas, San Diego, CA, USA
 Hale Thompson, Minneapolis, MN, USA
 Virginia Tonelli, Des Moines, IA, USA
 William Torres, Vega Baja, PR, USA
 Robert Toth, Cleveland, Oh, USA
 John Weatherman, San Francisco, CA, USA
 Julene Weaver, Seattle, WA, USA
 Matthias Wienold, Hanover, Germany
 Snow William, San Francisco, CA, USA
 Bonnie Williams, Saratoga, CA, USA
 Seanna Williams, Orem, UT, USA
 William Wilson, Chicago, IL, USA
 Joe Wright, Cambridge, MA, USA
 Louis Zimmerman, Aurora, CO, USA

References

1. Strategic Timing of Antiretroviral Treatment (START).
<http://clinicaltrials.gov/ct2/show/NCT00867048>
2. Severe P et al. 2009. A randomized clinical trial of early versus standard antiretroviral therapy for HIV-infected patients with a CD4 T cell count of 200-350 cells/ml (CIPRAHT001). Paper presented at: 49th Interscience Conference on Antimicrobial Agents and Chemotherapy; Sep 12-15; San Francisco, CA. Abstract H1230c.
3. Emery S et al. Major clinical outcomes in antiretroviral therapy (ART)-naive participants and in those not receiving ART at baseline in the SMART study. *J Infect Dis.* 2008;197(8):1133-1144.
4. Panel on Antiretroviral Guidelines for Adults and Adolescents. Guidelines for the use of antiretroviral agents in HIV-1-infected adults and adolescents. Department of Health and Human Services. December 1, 2009; 1-161.
<http://www.aidsinfo.nih.gov/ContentFiles/AdultandAdolescentGL.pdf>
5. Phillips et al. Early initiation of treatment for HIV infection. *The Lancet*, Volume 375, Issue 9715, Page 639, 20 February 2010. doi:10.1016/S0140-6736(10) 60269-3.
6. Hernán M, Robins J, Early versus Deferred Antiretroviral Therapy for HIV, Correspondence, *N Engl J Med* 2009; 361:822-824